

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM

PROPERTY

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	SELECTION CRITERIA				Total Score	Comments
			1 Purchase Price	2 Qualifications of Proposer	3 Benefit to PHA	4 Responsiveness to the RFP		
Multiple carriers (Domestic, Foreign, & Lloyd's) in three layers	1,087,759						RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD	
<u>\$25M Excess of \$50M</u> \$75 Million							1. Lowest quote. Renewal offered 4% rate decrease. Lower deductible. 2. All highly rated by AM Best(A XV or greater); good reputation; outstanding service 3. All incumbent carriers 4. Proposals met all RFP specifications. PHA's Property Insurance Program is very complex. Total Insured Value is approx. \$147.2M. This figure includes the following: Buildings, Contents, EDP, and Other (e.g., electrical substation, wharf crane switch boxes, high mast lites) The Total Loss Limit is \$75 M, currently provided in three separate layers of insurance. Carriers participate in one of the three. The Primary layer is \$20M; 2nd layer is \$30M; 3rd layer is \$25M. When the \$20 M limits of 1st layer are exhausted, the limits of 2nd layer take effect. If the additional \$30 M limits in the 2nd layer are exhausted, the 3rd layer takes over and covers an additional maximum amount of \$25 M. Carrier's risk decreases as it moves to a higher layer and vice versa. Those in the lowest layer receive the bulk of the total premiums paid.	
Sompo Japan Ins Co of America Hannover & Lloyd's Liberty E&S AXIS Surplus		0%						
<u>\$30M Excess of \$20M</u> \$50 Million								
Hannover & Lloyd's Liberty E&S AXIS Surplus Westchester Lloyd's of London Evanston Ins Co		0%						
<u>\$20M Primary</u> \$20 Million								
Hannover & Lloyd's Liberty E&S AXIS Surplus Westchester Lloyd's of London Arch		0%						
Others Refer to attached								

Information in bold text indicates small business

For Executive Director and Port Commissioners Only.

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

**Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM
CONTRACTORS EQUIPMENT**

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
			1	2	3	4		
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP	Total Score	Comments
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
Travelers Lloyd's	\$700,400	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Only proposal received. 7.4% rate decrease, even with \$2M loss 2. Incumbent; AM Best Rating A++ XV; good reputation; outstanding service 3. No change from current terms and conditions. 4. Proposal met all RFP specifications.

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

**Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM
EXCESS WORKERS' COMPENSATION**

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
			1	2	3	4		
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP	Total Score	Comments
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
Colony	\$187,898	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Best terms and pricing recieved. 13.9% rate decrease. 2. AM Best Rating A IX; 3. No change from current terms and conditions. 4. Proposal met all RFP specifications.
NY Marine	\$230,019	0%	35	25	20	15	95	1. Incumbent; flat rate 2. Non-competitive quote
Midwest Employers	\$163,328	0%	38	25	10	0	73	1. Quoted only \$1M SIR 2. Did not meet RFP specifications.
Midwest Employers	\$143,759	0%	38	25	10	0	73	1. Quoted only \$1.25M SIR 2. Did not meet RFP specifications.

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM

MARINE HULL/PROTECTION & INDEMNITY

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
			1	2	3	4		
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP	Total Score	Comments
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
Berkley/StarNet	\$116,755	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Best terms and pricing recieved. 31% rate decrease. 2. AM Best Rating A XV; good reputation 3. No change from current terms and conditions. Includes terrorism coverage. 4. Proposal met all RFP specifications.
Markel	\$148,097	0%	30	25	10	15	80	1. Incumbent- Non-competitive pricing.
Atlantic Specialty	\$148,025	0%	30	25	10	15	80	1. Non-competitive pricing.

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM

PUBLIC OFFICIALS

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
			1	2	3	4		
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP	Total Score	Comments
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
AIG	\$119,111	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Best terms and pricing recieved. 9.7% rate decrease. 2. Incumbent; AM Best Rating A XV; good reputation; outstanding service 3. No change from current terms and conditions. Claims made policy - not advisable to change carriers. 4. Proposal met all RFP specifications.
Chubb/ACE	\$75,000	0%	38	25	20	15	98	1. Quoted \$5M/\$10M Primary. 2. Did not meet RFP specifications.
Ironshore	\$109,000	0%	38	25	20	15	98	1. Quoted \$15Mil/\$15Mil. 2. Did not meet RFP specifications.

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM

TERRORISM

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	1	2	3	4	Total Score	Comments
			Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP		
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
Lloyd's	\$59,179	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Only proposal received. 5% rate reduction decrease 2. Incumbent; AM Best Rating A XV; good reputation; outstanding service 3. Proposal met all RFP specifications.

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM

BOILER & MACHINERY

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
			1	2	3	4		
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP	Total Score	Comments
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
Travelers	\$61,144	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Best terms and pricing recieved. 2. Incumbent; AM Best Rating A++ XV; good reputation; outstanding service 3. No change from current terms and conditions. Includes terrorism coverage. 4. Proposal met all RFP specifications.
Hartford Steam	\$82,000	0%	35	25	20	15	95	1. Indication - Not competitive

Port of Houston Authority Evaluation Form

Project: RFP - 215 2017-2018 P&C INSURANCE PROGRAM

BROAD FORM POLLUTION for P&I (MARINE)

Date: Jan. 20, 2017

			SELECTION CRITERIA					
			1	2	3	4		
Vendor	Proposal Amount	Small Business Information SB Goal SB Prime % SB Subs	Purchase Price	Qualifications of Proposer	Benefit to PHA	Responsiveness to the RFP	Total Score	Comments
Project Relative Weight (%)			40%	25%	20%	15%	100%	
Safe Harbor/Starr Indemnity	\$12,150	0%	40	25	20	15	100	1. Best terms and pricing recieved. 2. Incumbent; AM Best Rating A XIV; good reputation; outstanding service 3. No change from current terms and conditions. 4. Proposal met all RFP specifications.
WQIS	\$14,500	0%	30	25	15	15	85	1. Quoted -couldn't match current premium
Lloyd's	\$18,950	0%	25	25	10	15	75	1. Not competitive - couldn't match terms and conditions